Promoting gender balance and inclusion in research, innovation and training: advancements and challenges

Prof. Tullia Gallina Toschi

Scientific Coordinator PLOTINA Horizon 2020 Project GA n° 666008
Alma Mater Studiorum – Università di Bologna (ITALY)
PLOTINA is an EU funded H2020 project that started in February 2016 (total duration: 48 months).

Overall objective: to enable the development, implementation and assessment of self-tailored Gender Equality Plans with innovative strategies for the RPOs involved, by: stimulating a gender-aware culture change; promoting career-development of researchers to prevent the waste of talents, particularly for women; ensuring diversification of views in research and teaching.

Alma Mater Studiorum-Università di Bologna, UNIBO (Italia); Kemijski Inštitut-National Institute of Chemistry, NIC (Slovenia); Mondragon Unibersitatea, MU (Spagna); Zentrum fuer Soziale Innovation GMBH, ZSI (Austria); Ozyegin Universitesi, OZU (Turchia); Centro Studi Progetto Donna e Diversity MGMT, PD (Italia); University of Warwick (UK); Lisbon School of Economics and Management, ISEG (Portogallo); JUMP (Belgio); Elhuyar (Spagna)
PLOTINA aims at:

- Preventing underutilization of qualified female researchers by removing barriers to recruitment, retention and career progression, allowing the EU to benefit from the talents of all its researchers;

- Improving decision making by addressing gender imbalances; incorporating the sex/gender dimension in research especially where not applied.
Stages of development:

1. ✔ Assess the current situation in RPOs
2. ✔ Design GEPs for each RPO
3. □ Design, implement and evaluate Actions in the RPOs; — — — — — —
4. □ Create a platform of resources that can be used by RPOs across Europe to implement their own GEPs. — —

Gender Audit (GA)

A gender audit process assesses the extent to which gender equality is effectively institutionalized in the policies, programs, organisational structures and proceedings (including decision-making processes) and in the corresponding budgets. It is essentially a “social audit”, and belongs to the category of “quality audits”, which distinguishes it from traditional “financial audits” (EIGE - http://eige.europa.eu).
PLOTINA first stage: the Gender Audit

The purpose of the Gender Audit

- Collecting information on the “state of the art” related to RPOs personnel’s representations and perception and data on gender related issues
- Collecting feedbacks on the possible positive actions that can be developed and implemented in the Gender Equality Plan

The data collection for the Gender Audit was organized in two checklists and five key areas (KAs) were investigated.

| Qualitative | KA1 Governance bodies, key actors and decision-makers; |
| KA2 Recruitment, retention and career progression; |
| KA3 Work-personal life integration and balance; |
| Quantitative | KA4 Researchers and research: gender equality and sex and gender perspective; |
| KA5 Integration of sex and gender in study curricula. |
Tips for a successful Gender Audit

- RPOs governance should have already undertaken actions to promote gender equality in the Academia
- The governance should be very committed and if not, the Gender Audit Team needs to motivate key-actors and decision makers
- Involvement of all levels of the institution through the establishment of a network of departmental delegates (both researchers/professors and technical/administrative staff)
- Leadership and coordination capability
- The heterogeneity and interdisciplinarity of the Gender Audit Team skills and know-how
- A centralized data collection system (the audit provided efficiency and motivation for improvement)
- The relevance of training activities, seminars, vocational guidance workshops and career counselling
Next steps...

Gender Equality Plan (GEP)
- Key Areas
- Objectives
- Measures
- Direct and Indirect targets
- Who is in charge of this?

Monitoring tool
- Time line
- Indicators

Gender Audit (GA)

Lesson learned and future developments

2017 2018 2019 2020

Plotina has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement (G.A. No 666008). The views and opinions expressed in this publication are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Commission.
Gender Equality Plan (GEP): actions chosen by all RPOs

KA 1: Governance bodies, key actors and decision-makers

1.1 Routine revision of any text, communication, images, from a gender equality and diversity standing point.

1.2 Plan of regular GEP follow-up meetings with governance key actors and senior management (Vice-Rectors and Administrative Divisions Managers) to create ownership of the GEP, to strengthen the potential of the plan and to maximize its impact.

1.3 Gender sensitive language and images in institutional documents

Timing! Indicators!

Follow up of the coaches

6.1.3 Meetings for GEPs implementation
Sexual harassment prevention and support structures, at disposal and well communicated to all stakeholders.

Integration of gender equality as a core issue in the formal documents: policy, communication, marketing, ... for inside and outside stakeholders.

Gathering of gender disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data routinely, in departments/faculties/schools, if possible, in a digital format. Analysis of these data in a dedicated Report so as to monitor gender and diversity state of art in the organization and allow further data collection.

Provision of online and/or hard copies of gender equality and diversity policies for internal and external staff.

Promotion of initiatives to favour a widespread gender competence at all levels of the organization with provision of training to staff, teachers and researchers.
KA 2: Recruitment, career progression and retention

2.1 Sharing career good practices - role models for women (scientists, researchers and academics).

6.2.8 raising awareness on female role models - 6.2.9 raising awareness on gender diversity in research teams

Introduction/retention in the RPO’s internal research evaluation procedure of the consideration of maternity and parental leave periods in order to reach a more equal assessment.

6.2.6 Positive actions in research evaluation
KA 3: Work and personal life integration

3.1 Availability of **structured supports inside the organization** for child-care, family-members with special needs, elder family-members.

3.1 Demand and supply of basic childcare; 3.3 Provision of services for work and personal life integration

3.1 Feasibility plans for the creation of **new welfare services**, e.g. contract arrangements with service suppliers from family care duties and house chores to **summer camp organization**, to **child-care** in case of **conference or congress**.

6.3.1 Policies on work and personal life integration
KA 4: Researchers and research: gender equality and sex and gender perspective

4.1 Monitoring of all data regarding research disaggregated by gender: funding allocation, publications submission, excellence evaluation, patent applications.

6.4.3 Provision of an annual RPO gender report

4.1 Internal training seminars on the use of sex and gender perspective in research, to foster the acknowledgment of its economic, social and innovation value.

6.4.4 Participation in seminars on integrating sex/gender analysis, by gender and field of research

6.4.11 Perception of the gender/sex variables in research contents, by gender
GEP: actions chosen by 5/4 RPOs

KA 5: Integration of sex and gender dimension in teaching curricula

5.1 Availability of Guides and/or Workshops on the integration of gender equality and diversity issues in curriculum design, learning activities and/or program of study, as support for teaching staff.

6.5.3 Training seminars or guidelines on integrating sex/gender in teaching curricula

5.1 Specific courses available for students on gender equality and soft skills in their study curricula.

6.5.2 Sex/ gender variables in teaching modules/courses, per field of research
Plotina has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement (G.A NO 666008). The views and opinions expressed in this publication are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Commission.

With the GEP the University of Bologna aims to contribute to the achievement of the SDGs of the 2030 Agenda, following the objectives of its Strategic Plan 2016-2018. PLOTINA will focus on SDGs 5 (Gender equality) and 10 (Reduced inequalities).
Plotina has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement (G.A NO 666008). The views and opinions expressed in this publication are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Commission.

This data came from a survey investigating the link between the single course unit of a study programme and the U.N. SDGs. The survey was sent by email to the coordinators of study programmes at the University of Bologna. The response rate was 84.3% of the study programmes active in A.Y. 2016/2017, covering about 80% of all course units at the University of Bologna.

The number of students enrolled in a study programme containing a course unit “tagged” for that SD Goal in A.Y. 2016/2017.

Number of collaboration, teaching and mobility projects which were active as of 31 December 2016.

Number of documents that have cited the author for a document’s publication in the DB Scopus.

Research regarding the number of publications was taken from the Scopus database, considering all articles from 2007-2016 which contain a specific sequence of keywords and an author affiliated with University of Bologna. Keywords were chosen for each UN SD goal by considering the general declaration of the goals and all targets of each goal.
The international benchmarking includes universities within the top 50 of the QS World Universities Ranking 2016/2017 comparable to the University of Bologna in terms of:

- Size (XL - more than 30,000 students)
- Focus (FC - all 5 QS faculty areas, including the school of medicine)
- Research Intensity (Very High - more than 13,000 publications in the last 5 years)
- Status (Public)

The total number of articles was determined as described in "PUBLICATIONS IN SCOPUS". The total number of articles for each university and each goal was scaled against the number of academic staff as listed by QS for the World University Ranking 2016/2017 and published on www.topuniversities.com. By doing so, we eliminated any dimensional effect caused by simply considering the total number of publications. Finally, for each goal we compared the University of Bologna’s ratio with the average of the ratios for the 14 universities in the benchmark group. The result is the index number “benchmark = 100”; an index number higher than 100 means that “per capita publications” by UNIBO academics is higher than the average of the universities in the international benchmark group. If the index is lower than 100, UNIBO academic productivity is lower than the benchmark.

Following the parameters used for the selection of the international benchmarking, three Italian universities were selected from the first 400 in the QS World Universities Ranking 2016/2017. (La Sapienza, UNIPD, UNIMI) The Scopus research criteria and the index number calculation criteria were the same as that of international benchmarking.
Plotina has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement (G.A NO 666008). The views and opinions expressed in this publication are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Commission.

5. GENDER EQUALITY

THIRD MISSION

EVENTS PROMOTED ON GENDER RELATED ISSUES

The University of Bologna promotes the valorisation of gender-related issues through organisation, the participation, the promotion, the dissemination of public initiatives (such as the “Women in Science” seminars) and the establishment of Commissions where the University operates, as well as through the dissemination of publications, flyers, brochures, etc. on gender issues.

From an analysis of the events advertised through the online magazine of the University of Bologna, “unibm.org”, in 2016 were published 23 articles on gender-related issues.

INSTITUTIONS

BODIES FOR THE PROTECTION OF GENDER EQUALITY AT UNIVERSITY OF BOLOGNA:

1. Guarantee Committee for Equal Opportunities, Employee Wellbeing and Non-Discrimination at Work – CUS, the Harassment Adviser
2. Vice-rector of Human Resources
3. Delegate for Occupational Welfare
4. Delegate for Equal Opportunities
5. Harassment Adviser

THE GLASS CEILING INDEX (SH FIGURES, 2016)

The Glass Ceiling Index (GCI) is a relative index comparing the proportion of women in academia (grades A, B, and C) with the proportion of women in top academic positions (grades A positions equivalent to full professors in most countries) in a given year.

The GCI can range from 0 to 1. A score of 0.5 indicates that there is no difference between women and men in terms of their chance of being promoted.

A score of less than 1 means that women are more represented at the grades B and C than in grades A, while a score of more than 1 indicates the presence of a glass ceiling effect, meaning that women are less represented in grade A positions than in academic grades B and C.

In other words, the interpretation of the GCI is that the higher the value, the stronger the glass ceiling effect and the more difficult it is for women to move into a higher position.

The Gender Equality Plan of UNIBO

The Gender Equality Plan (GEP) of UNIBO is a flexible tool, comparable to a Positive Action Plan, which is constructed taking into account the characteristics and individual needs of each single research performing Organization (University or Research Centre).

The GEP of University of Bologna contains measures developed on the basis of the needs and the context analysis of the University of Bologna, an first assessment carried out through the valuable collaboration of its researchers, professors, technicians and administrative staff, vice-rectors, deans, managers and others (working “key actors”), during the Gender Audit phase of the UNIBO project, coordinated by the University of Bologna, that has been undertaken from February to December 2014.

This measures are poorly, but not exclusively, addressed to specific beneficiaries, being the main target of the GEP 4 call “female researchers”.

The institutional measures have been specifically foreseen to the years 2017 - 2020 (total duration of the PLOTINA project) and will be verified through the use of indicators, a monitoring system, the annual gender report and by peer reviews.
Expected outputs...PLOTINA Challenges

- Catalogue of core indicators
- Self-assessment /monitoring software

- Existing practices/actions that have been evidenced as effective
- New actions that RPOs of PLOTINA will test

- Examples of integrating gender in research projects to increase their validity
- Gendering teaching curricula

- Designed and implemented GEPs and successfully implemented Actions

TOOLS

GEPs LIBRARY OF ACTIONS

RESEARCH AND TEACHING CASE STUDIES

GOOD PRACTICES

Expected outputs...PLOTINA Challenges

- Catalogue of core indicators
- Self-assessment /monitoring software

- Existing practices/actions that have been evidenced as effective
- New actions that RPOs of PLOTINA will test

- Examples of integrating gender in research projects to increase their validity
- Gendering teaching curricula

- Designed and implemented GEPs and successfully implemented Actions

Expected outputs...PLOTINA Challenges

- Catalogue of core indicators
- Self-assessment /monitoring software

- Existing practices/actions that have been evidenced as effective
- New actions that RPOs of PLOTINA will test

- Examples of integrating gender in research projects to increase their validity
- Gendering teaching curricula

- Designed and implemented GEPs and successfully implemented Actions
Thank you for your attention

info@plotina.eu

www.plotina.eu

Plotina has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement (G.A NO 666008). The views and opinions expressed in this publication are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Commission.