A Regional Approach to Faculty Equity in Academic STEM Disciplines: Benefits and Challenges of a Multi-institutional Model

David Goldstein, Wright State University
Carolyn Phelps, University of Dayton
Suzanne Seleem, Central State University
Aihua Wood, Air Force Institute of Technology
LEADER Consortium: Launching Equity in the Academy across the Dayton Entrepreneurial Region

**Mission**
Identify, research, and implement best practices to increase the *recruitment*, *retention* and *advancement* of STEM women faculty.
The U. S. Air Force graduate school of engineering, ~800 students (military culture, STEM-only)

Small, historically black institution (HBCU); ~2000 students, mostly undergraduate

Private, Catholic and Marianist university; ~11,000 students, comprehensive undergraduate/graduate

Mid-size public university; ~17,000 students, comprehensive undergraduate/graduate
Our Collective Challenges

• Demographic under-representation & isolation of women (especially in engineering and physical sciences)
• Under-representation of women in leadership
• Transparency in gender equity/inclusion data
• Implementation of equitable/inclusive hiring & promotion practices
• Inconsistencies in departmental leadership training
• Lack of practices & policies to support dual-career hiring
Representative Data:
Women are poorly represented among faculty in engineering and physical sciences

*Number of *s denotes number of women at Full Professor rank in that department
Representative Data:
Women have sought promotion less readily than men
Representative Data:
Women have been under-represented at higher faculty ranks and in administrative roles.

TFP = Tenured Full Professor
AD = Assistant Dean
CD = Associate Dean
VP = Vice President
EC = Executive Committee of Faculty Senate
Examples of ongoing institutional efforts

• Programs to support mentoring
  • mentoring policies in individual colleges
  • mentoring circles (based on Every Other Thursday)

• Institutional dual career policy

• Customized training programs, e.g., for hiring committees

• Good efforts but not sufficient
We recognized potential benefits of a regional approach

• The region provides a community of colleagues

• A collective approach enhances resources for all

• Diversity in cultures affords diverse models for best practices

• Sharing challenges and successes creates social contract
We developed leadership teams that integrated across institutions

**LEADER Council: Administrative guidance, support, and oversight**

The LEADER Council provides oversight over all aspects of the Consortium, including developing Consortium-level institional structures and setting benchmarks for success. Members of the Council include senior-level administrators (Associate Provost or above) with institutional oversight for equity, institutional coordinators, and members of the Leadership team.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AFIT</th>
<th>CSU</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>AFIT</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Dean for Research</td>
<td>• Associate Provost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Associate Dean for Academic Affairs</td>
<td>• Dean, Science and Engineering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• LEADER co-PI</td>
<td>• LEADER co-PI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UD</th>
<th>WSU</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>University of Dayton</strong></td>
<td><strong>Wright State University</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Associate Provost</td>
<td>• Dean, Science and Mathematics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Dean, Arts and Sciences</td>
<td>• Associate Provost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• LEADER co-PI</td>
<td>• LEADER co-PI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LEADER Council also created a social contract: commitment to a shared mission and accountability

We the undersigned commit to working toward the following objectives, and to sharing our successes and challenges in meeting these goals:
Leadership Training engaged Department Chairs

Initially generated internally:

- Workshops for Department Chairs
  - Meeting the Challenges of Dual-Career Couples
  - Functional Mentoring Model
  - Annual Faculty Performance Reviews

Subsequently shifted to a broader regional organization:

- Provide training explicitly targeted at promoting equity
- Create collegiality between leaders across institutions

SOCHE Academic Leadership Fellows Workshop
Equity advisors provided leadership within faculty ranks

- Faculty members trained to promote equitable practices in hiring and workplace climate
- Engagement across institutions provides
  - Common training
  - Sharing of strategies and challenges
  - Awareness of opportunities for hiring, collaboration, etc.
The Challenges of Sustaining a Multi-Institutional Model

- Communication
- Collaboration
- Coordination
Programming

- Workshops and presentations hosted by partner institutions
- Open to all
- Promotes faculty development
- Promotes direct interaction of colleagues across campuses
- Promotes visibility of administrative support for equity
BUT overcoming habits so that faculty engage in programming at other universities, and coordinating schedules and logistics across institutions, are real challenges.
Leadership matters...

- STEM tenure-track faculty hiring at CSU over a five-year period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consortium STEM Faculty New Hires by Gender and Year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Tenure track faculty hires in the UD School of Engineering since 2014
...but changes in leadership are common

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Change since 2014?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFIT Chancellor</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFIT Provost</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFIT Dean, Engineering and Management</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSU President</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSU Provost</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSU Dean, Science and Engineering</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UD President</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UD Provost</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UD Dean, Engineering</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UD Dean, Arts and Sciences</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WSU President</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WSU Provost</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WSU Dean, Engineering</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WSU Dean, Science and Math</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sharing information across institutions is easy...

The Ohio, Western Pennsylvania, West Virginia HERC is a collaborative response to the challenges of recruiting and retaining talented and diverse faculty and staff.

https://www.hercjobs.org/oh-western-pa-wv/
...but sharing finances across institutions is difficult!
“Institutional Practice” documents are useful...

Faculty Mentoring: Policy & Resources

Policy Statement .................................................. 1
Formal Mentoring: Faculty-Driven, Functional, and Flexible .... 2
Policy Goals ...................................................... 2
Participation, Accountability, and Assessment ................. 3
Mentors ............................................................. 3
Protégés ............................................................. 4
Department Chairs .............................................. 5
Policy Review and Revision .................................... 5
Best Practices for Department Chairs ......................... 6
Best Practices for Mentors ..................................... 8
Best Practices for Protégés .................................... 12

Human Resources

Dual Career Resources at the University of Dayton

The University of Dayton is committed to the recruitment, hiring and promotion of outstanding, diverse faculty and staff who value their mission and share its commitment to academic excellence in teaching, research and artistic creativity, the development of the whole person, and leadership and service in the local and global community. In support of this commitment, the University is pleased to provide support for spouses of prospective and newly hired faculty. The dual career program serves as a resource and support system and is not intended to take the place of one's own job search efforts. While we cannot guarantee placement, we will serve as an effective support system for your spouse.

Employment in academic areas

For spouses pursuing employment in academic areas, the provost’s office works with spouses of faculty members to investigate possible positions available at the University of Dayton. Current open positions at the University can be found on the UO jobs website. The University is also a member of HERC, which provides access to a comprehensive list of openings at institutions within a commutable distance. For more information regarding academic positions, please contact Carolyn Roekler Philips, associate provost for faculty and administrative affairs at 937-229-3425 or careen.philips@udayton.edu.
4.6. The Equity Advisor provides recommendations to search committees on equity issues associated with faculty searches. The Equity Advisor is also available to provide information to prospective faculty members during the interview phase about the Graduate School’s equity initiatives that support faculty development and advancement.

Attach a copy of the recruiting advertisement and committee’s rating criteria for applicant reviews and candidate interviews

Routing, Coordination, Approval
Search Committee Chair:
Signature ___________________________ Date _____________

Department Head:
Signature ___________________________ Date _____________

Equity Advisor:
Signature ___________________________ Date _____________
...and it is difficult to create formal policies that cross institutions
Are we there yet?

Local approach vs. Regional approach

- Institutional Change
- IMPROVED CLIMATE
- Department Change
- Individual Change

Regional change
Acknowledgments

Grant Leadership
• Michele Wheatly
• Malcolm Daniels
• Patrick Donnelly
• Kimberly Kendricks
• Heidi Reis
• Joseph Saliba
• Tamera Schneider
• Stephanie Goodwin

Upper administration
• Kimberly Barrett
• Paul Benson
• Lovette Chinwah
• Willie Houston
• Henry Limouze
• Bill Rickert
• Subramania Sritharan
• Marlin Thomas
• Paul Wolf

Faculty and Program Support
• Rebecca Blust
• Peggy Desautels
• Wiebke Diestelkamp
• Tarun Goswami
• Larry Prochaska
• Joe Ross
• Amy Hillard
• Marcella Hurtado Gomez
• Jessica McClary